



January 6, 2020

# BUILDERS' PLANS RATED 'D'

North Village Committee  
 Northfield Township  
 8350 Main Street  
 Whitmore Lake, Michigan 48189

EVALUATION CRITERIA LINE 2 RATES PROJECT SCOPE AND DESIGN AGAINST WRITTEN GOALS  
 LIVONIA BUILDERS SCORED 45.38 OUT OF A POSSIBLE 65 POINTS, 69%  
 AR BROUWER SCORED 43.13 OUT OF 65 POINTS, 66%  
 THESE SCORES TELL THE TALE. NEITHER BUILDER MET THE TOWNSHIP'S WRITTEN GOALS.

**SUBJECT: NORTH VILLAGE RFQ SCORING MATRIX RESULTLS AND NORTH VILLAGE SUBCOMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION**

Honorable Trustees

## REAL GRADE:

Per the Township Board request, the North Village Subcommittee has completed evaluation of the proposals / purchase offers submitted by Livonia Builders and A. R. Brouwer. The results of the evaluation and Committee recommendation are included here for Board Consideration.

**North Village Subcommittee Combined Evaluation Results:**

- Livonia Builders Average Score 80.13
- A. R. Brouwer Average Score 76.00

**LIVONIA BUILDERS 69%**

**AR BROUWER 66%**

All 8 committee participants completed the evaluation.

Evaluation Criteria	Possible Score	Average Score LB	Average Score ARB
1. Demonstrated development experience by the applicant in completing mixed-use projects and/or projects of a similar nature to that which is proposed.	5	4.38	4.88
2. Compatibility and appropriateness of the proposed project scope and design in relation to the Township's stated goals. <i>Note: Points are available for each stated design objective.</i>	65	45.38	43.13
3. Experience in developing projects with creative and innovative approaches.	5	5.00	4.13
4. Experience of principals and team members.	5	4.88	5.00
5. Evidence of financial capability and ability to finance project. Examples of similar project financing experience strongly encouraged.	5	5.00	4.50
6. Demonstrated ability to deliver high quality projects on an established timeline.	5	4.75	4.75
7. Demonstrated ability to enter into a public / private partnership.	5	3.63	3.63
8. References – include up to three public agency references from communities or school districts where developer has successfully completed projects.	5	5.00	4.88
9. Any other criteria deemed important by the Township as important to evaluation of proposals, in its sole discretion. <i>Note: evaluators may optionally award 5 bonus points with justification notes provided.</i>	5	2.13	1.13
Total possible out of 100	105	80.13	76.00

45.38/65 = 69%  
 43.13/65 = 66%

ZING? ZEST?  
 VERVE? FUN?  
 PANACHE?  
 NOT MUCH...

**BUILDER CAPABILITY COMPRISES THE REMAINING FACTORS. IN THIS CASE IT'S A MEASURE OF HOW WELL THEY CAN BUILD A D GRADE IMITATION OF THE TOWNSHIP'S GOALS. ADD IT TO THE GOALS SCORE, IT SUDDENLY LOOKS BETTER, GREAT NEWS IF YOU DON'T GIVE A RIP ABOUT ETHICS OR QUALITY. NEAT TRICK, PLANNER LIPPENS.**

HEADQUARTERS  
 235 East Main Street  
 Suite 105  
 Northville, Michigan 48167

O 248.596.0920  
 F 248.596.0930  
 MCKA.COM

**INFLATED GRADE: 76% C**

**72% C-**